

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
HELD IN WASHINGTON, D.C.

17 March 1965

INDEX

Page

SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS-INTERVIEWS

1. Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers 1-2
2. District of Columbia Government, Department of Highways and Traffic
 - a. H Street Underpass - Proposed Design 2
 - b. Inner Loop Freeway, Center Leg - Proposed Design 2-3
3. District of Columbia Government, Department of Buildings and Grounds
 - a. Junior Village School - Revised Design 3-4
 - b. Elementary School, Nichols Ave. & Howard Road, S.E. 4
4. D. C. Redevelopment Land Agency

Tenth Street Mall - Revised Design 4
5. Department of the Navy, Area Public Works Office
 - a. 1500 Man Dormitory Bolling/Anacostia-Revised Design 4-5
 - b. 300 Units of Family Housing, Bolling/Anacostia 4-5
6. National Institutes of Health

Refrigeration Building-Revised Design 5

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
HELD IN WASHINGTON, D.C.

I. CONVENE, ROOM 7000, INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING

The second session of the regular monthly meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts was held in its offices in the Interior Department Building on 17 March 1965. The members met, pursuant to notice, at 9:30 a.m., with William Walton, Chairman, presiding.

Present were: William Walton
Gordon Bunshaft
Burnham Kelly
Theodore Roszak
Aline Saarinen
John Carl Warnecke

Staff: C.H. Atherton, Secretary
Paul Richard, Admin. Asst.
Nancy Coyne, Legislative Asst.
Myra Younker, Editor

NCPC; Arnall T. Connell
Donald Jackson

Recorder: Steve Miller

The minutes of the February meeting were approved as written.

II. SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS-INTERVIEWS

1. Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers

Mr. Webel, representing the Corps of Engineers, and the architects, who prepared designs for buildings to be constructed at Fort Myer, attended the meeting during the discussion of the following projects:

- a. NCO Open Mess - Mr. Groell, also presented a master plan for Fort Myer;
- b. Enlisted Mens' Service Club - Mr. Stein; and
- c. NCO Family Housing - Mr. Lethbridge.

Chairman Walton requested that the presentations of the projects be brief as the members of the Commission had reviewed thoroughly the material presented in detail by the Secretary on the previous day. After an intro-

duction of the projects by each architect, the members discussed the development of the entire area of Fort Myer centering their comments on the master plan.

The master plan contained no clear architectural organization, nor any consideration of the presence of Arlington Cemetery. The plan was considered insufficient as an architectural master plan. The entire area of Fort Myer should be planned as a whole. The immediate environment - Arlington Cemetery - should have been more carefully considered.

To illustrate the Commission's ideas of a designed master plan for the area, Chairman Walton invited the architects and Mr. Webel into the gallery where drawings depicted the successful solution to a similar problem at the Bolling/Anacostia Cantonment, where the problem of a designed master plan for the entire Cantonment had been successfully solved by the Navy Department.

As pointed out by Mr. Bunshaft, the initial submission for the Bolling/Anacostia Cantonment was for a specific project on a specific site rather than a plan for the development of the total site.

The Secretary prepared a letter for the Chairman's signature to the Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers, stating the members' disapproval of the plan and their recommendation that a designed master plan be prepared for the entire area of Fort Myer.

EXHIBIT A

2. District of Columbia Government, Department of Highways and Traffic

a. H Street Underpass - Proposed Design

Mr. Sawyer, Department of Highways and Traffic, District of Columbia Government, presented briefly the design for the renovation of the H Street Underpass. The members of the Commission had reviewed thoroughly the material presented in detail by the Secretary on the previous day.

The Secretary prepared a letter for the Chairman's signature to the Department of Highways and Traffic expressing the members' approval of the design.

EXHIBIT B

b. Inner Loop Freeway, Center Leg - Proposed Design

Mr. Sawyer and Mr. Prokosch, Department of Highways and Traffic, attended the meeting during the discussion of the design for the Center Leg of the Inner Loop Freeway.

Mr. Prokosch described the 4000 feet length of the depressed, 4-lane highway. Granite would be used for the base of the entire structure. The open cut embankment scheme provided green slopes for the sides which would

be landscaped. The vertical-cut scheme would scar the area less and could have trees on the upper level, if more land were acquired. Signs required further study. According to Mr. Sawyer, the Highway Department planned to have the landscape architect and sign engineer develop a criteria for signs which will be presented to the Commission later.

The comments of the members reflected their approval of the straight-wall scheme (vertical-cut) and the selection of granite. The acquisition of more land to plant trees which would serve as sound and visual barriers was also favored. The members stressed the importance of the design and placement of signs.

Mr. Kelly mentioned the parking facility, an air-rights structure which should be considered when designing freeways. The design of this portion of the Inner Loop would establish the character of future highway construction throughout the city.

The Secretary prepared a letter for the Chairman's signature to the Department of Highways and Traffic expressing the Commission's approval of the design and recommendation that more land be acquired. EXHIBIT C

3. District of Columbia Government, Department of Buildings and Grounds

a. Junior Village School - Revised Design

Mr. Gerald Purcell, Liaison Officer, Department of Buildings and Grounds, and Mr. Peake of Victor Spector and Associates, architectural firm, attended the meeting during the discussion of this project.

Chairman Walton requested that the members be permitted to comment on plans which were reviewed on the previous day.

Mr. Bunshaft began the comments by expressing the members' appreciation of the changes made as recommended during the February meeting. The kindergarten was oriented to the south which permitted more sunlight in the room. The roof design had been simplified and only one material would be used as exterior material.

Mr. Purcell commented on the future expansion program for the school. The members suggested that the kindergarten be separated from the main classroom block.

Mr. Warnecke recommended that a master plan for the entire area be submitted to the Commission. Current projects and the future expansion program should be planned as a unit rather than individually.

The members approved the revised design for the school.

The Secretary prepared a letter for the Chairman's signature to the Department of Buildings and Grounds stating the Commission's approval and requesting that a master plan be developed for the area. EXHIBIT D

b. Elementary School, Nichols Avenue and Howard Road, S.E.-Proposed Design

Mr. Purcell, Department of Buildings and Grounds, and Mr. Stanley McGaughan, architect, attended the meeting during the discussion of the design for an elementary school which would replace the Nichols Avenue school.

Mr. McGaughan explained the site for the 30-room, 3-story building. The requirements for a maximum recreation area determined the siting of the building. The theater and PEPCO substation prevented a more acceptable site solution.

Although the Board of Education had accepted the plan, the members could not approve it. They commented that the site should be restudied and have one basic concept rather than two architectural designs.

The Secretary prepared a letter for the Chairman's signature to the Department of Buildings and Grounds, stating the members disapproval. EXHIBIT E

4. D. C. Redevelopment Land Agency

Tenth Street Mall - Revised Design

The review of the plan for the Tenth Street Mall with Mr. Stanley Sherman, Redevelopment Land Agency, and Mr. John Wright, architect, was cancelled. During a study of the plans on the previous day, the members of the Commission decided that no action could be taken on the plan until it had been coordinated with landscape plans for buildings being constructed in this area.

5. Department of the Navy, Area Public Works Office

a. 1500 Man Dormitory, Bolling/Anacostia - Revised Design

b. 300 Units of Family Housing, Bolling/Anacostia - Revised Design

Mr. Huber and Mr. Barger, of Vincent Kling, architectural firm; Captain Enger and Lt. Comdr. Burdick, Department of the Navy; Col. Fletcher, Department of the Air Force; and Mr. Barth, Department of Defense, attended the meeting during the discussion of these two projects.

Mr. Huber explained the changes in the master plan which consisted of an additional chapel. The larger chapel would be near the dormitories and family units, and the smaller chapel near the water. The administration

building was now located in the complex with the theater, bowling alley, hobby shop and club. The elevators in the U-shaped dormitories were now located in the center of the building. The family housing units were nearer the River and reoriented slightly. Materials for the exterior walls and roof will be submitted later.

Chairman Walton expressed the members' views by stating that the plan was a good one and could become a model for other Department of Defense developments.

The Secretary prepared a letter for the Chairman's signature to the Area Public Works Office stating the Commission's approval of the revised design.

EXHIBIT F

6. National Institutes of Health

Refrigeration Building - Revised Design

Mr. J. Rowland Snyder, Public Buildings Service; Mr. Howard H. Biggs, NIH; and Mr. David Feder, architect/engineer, attended the meeting during the discussion of the revised design of the Refrigeration Building.

Mr. Bunshaft led the discussion stating that the building should be located in the pre-established service area and not in an open-green area. He stressed that land in the area was becoming more valuable since less land is available for future expansion plans. Maintaining a separate service unit would be more costly than having all service facilities in one area. Mr. Kelly questioned the apparent disregard for future expansion programs.

Mr. Feder maintained that a large amount of money would be saved constructing the refrigeration building on the proposed site.

The members were not convinced that this was the most practical solution. They recommended that all service facilities be centrally located and that the open area be retained for future laboratories.

The Secretary prepared a letter for the Chairman's signature, to the officials of the National Institutes of Health, stating the Commission's disapproval of the site for the Refrigeration Building.

EXHIBIT G

The Commission adjourned at 12:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

C. H. Atherton
Secretary

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

WILLIAM WALTON, Chairman

GORDON BUNSHAFT

ALINE B. SAARINEN

BURNHAM KELLY

HIDEO SASAKI

THEODORE ROSZAK

JOHN CARL WARNECKE

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

1 April 1965

INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING
WASHINGTON

Dear Colonel Proctor:

At its regular meeting on March 17, the Commission of Fine Arts considered three projects to be constructed by the Corps of Engineers at Fort Myer, Virginia.

The Commission members did not discuss in detail the individual projects submitted for review (The NCO Open Mess, the Enlisted Mens' Service Club, and the NCO Family Housing Complex) but instead centered their criticism on the master plan controlling the entire Fort Myer construction program.

The plan was disapproved for two major reasons.

The plan itself, as well as the individual projects submitted, showed no consideration for the Arlington National Cemetery, located immediately adjacent to the Fort Myer site.

The Cemetery is a National Shrine with unique symbolic and physical characteristics, and all construction projects affecting its environment must be considered with the utmost care.

The Fort Myer master plan submitted at the March meeting seemed to ignore the presence of the Cemetery, both in terms of siting and three-dimensional architectural massing. In the Commission's view it was consequently found to be totally unacceptable.

In addition, the members believe that the master plan for such an important installation must be controlled by a strong, clearly stated, three-dimensional architectural idea. No such underlying architectural concept was evident in the design submitted.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Lt. Col. F. B. Proctor
District Engineer
U.S. Army Engineer District, Norfolk
Foot of Front Street
Norfolk 10, Virginia

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

WILLIAM WALTON, Chairman

GORDON BUNSHAFT

ALINE B. SAARINEN

BURNHAM KELLY

HIDEO SASAKI

THEODORE ROSZAK

JOHN CARL WARNECKE

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

30 March 1965

INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING
WASHINGTON

Dear General Duke:

At its regular meeting on March 17, the Commission of Fine Arts considered plans for the proposed rehabilitation of the H Street Underpass.

The Commission approved the proposed design and urged that the Underpass be detailed as simply and inconspicuously as possible.

In addition, the members felt that all visible building materials should match, as closely as possible, those already approved by the Commission of Fine Arts for other highway underpasses so as to unify the appearance of the District's highway projects.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Brigadier General C. M. Duke
Engineer Commissioner for the
District of Columbia
District Building
Washington, D. C. 20004

EXHIBIT B

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

WILLIAM WALTON, Chairman

GORDON BUNSHAFT

ALINE B. SAARINEN

BURNHAM KELLY

HIDEO SASAKI

THEODORE ROSZAK

JOHN CARL WARNECKE

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

5 April 1965

INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING
WASHINGTON

Dear General Duke:

At its regular meeting on March 17, the Commission of Fine Arts considered a proposed design for a portion of the Center Leg of the Inner Loop running between Indiana and New York Avenues, N.W.

Two proposed solutions were submitted. One provided broad landscaped embankments lining the eight-lane highway. The other scheme called for vertical granite retaining walls at the edges of the roadway.

Noting that the introduction of a major superhighway in an area adjacent to the Mall and the Capitol will inevitably disturb the urban fabric of the city, the members preferred the vertical cut solution which, they felt, would minimize the destructive effects of the highway's construction.

They urged, in addition, that a sufficiently wide right-of-way be purchased to provide adequate space for a landscaping screen along the edges of the highway cut. They also stressed the importance of treating buildings adjacent to the right-of-way as an integral part of the overall design.

Since the design finally approved for this portion of the Center Leg will set the visual character of the entire Inner Loop, great care should be taken in the detailing of lighting standards, signs and the other street furniture of the highway system.

A model of the entire Inner Loop, showing signs, ramps, landscaping, and surrounding buildings, should be contained in future submissions.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Brigadier General C. M. Duke
Engineer Commissioner for the
District of Columbia
District Building
Washington, D.C. 20004

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

WILLIAM WALTON, Chairman

GORDON BUNSHAFT

ALINE B. SAARINEN

BURNHAM KELLY

HIDEO SASAKI

THEODORE ROSZAK

JOHN CARL WARNECKE

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

29 March 1965

INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING
WASHINGTON

Dear General Duke:

At its regular meeting on March 17, the Commission of Fine Arts considered revised plans for a new school and activities building to be constructed at Junior Village.

In approving the revised design, the Commission members found the building well planned, compact, and a marked improvement over the original submission.

The members, however, felt the following minor modifications might further improve the design:

- . The raised roof section over the auditorium-gymnasium should be treated with concrete rather than metal to minimize the number of external building materials used.

- . The horizontal fascia strip above the windows should be simplified.

- . The lobby linking the main building with the classroom wing should be enlarged.

In addition, the members questioned the placement of the kindergarten in an entirely separate wing, and suggested the architect consider the feasibility of incorporating it into the classroom block.

Exterior materials, once selected, should be submitted to the Commission for review.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Brigadier General C. M. Duke
Engineer Commissioner for the
District of Columbia
District Building
Washington, D.C. 20004

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

WILLIAM WALTON, Chairman

GORDON BUNSHAFT

ALINE B. SAARINEN

BURNHAM KELLY

HIDEO SASAKI

THEODORE ROSZAK

JOHN CARL WARNECKE

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

29 March 1965

INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING
WASHINGTON

Dear General Duke:

At its regular meeting on March 17, the Commission of Fine Arts considered plans for a new elementary school to be constructed at Nichols Avenue and Howard Road, S.E.

The Commission disapproved the proposed design.

The members found the school's site plan to be completely unacceptable. As proposed, the school's three story classroom block would face blank brick walls across a narrow service alley. Students entering the school from the playground would use the same doorway provided for service to the lunchroom and the school's utilities room. Insufficient space for landscaping and parking was provided about the classroom block. The members felt it essential that these difficulties be resolved.

The design of the building with its three separate units, kindergarten, multi-purpose room, and classroom block, should be unified and tightened.

The school's internal circulation was also criticized. The main entrance should be located nearer the building's primary vertical circulation.

Although the building's elevations were not considered in depth, the Commission pointed out that the treatment of roof forms and corner stair towers required further study.

The architect was requested to study various siting schemes which the Commission will review at its next meeting.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Brigadier General C. M. Duke
Engineer Commissioner for the District
of Columbia
District Building
Washington, D. C. 20004

EXHIBIT E

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

WILLIAM WALTON, Chairman

GORDON BUNSHAFT

ALINE B. SAARINEN

BURNHAM KELLY

HIDEO SASAKI

THEODORE ROSZAK

JOHN CARL WARNECKE

CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

29 March 1965

INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING
WASHINGTON

Dear Captain Enger:

At its regular meeting on March 17, the Commission of Fine Arts considered revised designs of the dormitory and family housing complex planned for construction at Bolling/Anacostia.

The Commission members were encouraged by the continuing improvement of the design, and felt that the entire project was consistent with high standards of architectural planning.

In reiterating their concern for proper landscaping throughout the project, the members were pleased to learn that the restraints of the minimal landscaping budget, applying to the family housing area, would not extend to the entire complex.

They also urged the most careful selection of exterior building materials, especially on the roofs of the low rise building, and requested that these materials, once selected, be submitted for review at some future date.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Captain W. M. Enger
U. S. Navy
Area PublicWorks Officer
Building 57, U.S. Naval Station
Washington, D.C. 20390

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS MAY 17, 1910

WILLIAM WALTON, Chairman
GORDON BUNSHAFT ALINE B. SAARENEN
BURNHAM KELLY HIDEO SASAKI
THEODORE ROSZAK JOHN CARL WARNECKE
CHARLES H. ATHERTON, Secretary

30 March 1965

INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING
WASHINGTON

Dear Mr. Snyder:

At its regular meeting on March 17, the Commission of Fine Arts considered plans for the construction of a new 18,000 ton refrigeration building at the National Institutes of Health.

In rejecting the proposed design, the Commission members seriously questioned the siting of the new building, and urged that it be redesigned as an integral part of the existing service and utilities complex.

To construct the plant on the proposed site would constitute a serious deviation from the NIH master plan previously approved by the Commission of Fine Arts.

Engineering requirements, which apparently determined the selection of the site, failed to take into consideration the serious disadvantages of establishing a secondary service area on property which logically should be reserved for future expansion of the Institutes' laboratory and research facilities.

For the Commission of Fine Arts:

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Mr. J. Rowland Snyder
Director, Design Division
Public Buildings Service
General Services Administration
Washington, D. C.

MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
17 March 1965

AM

9:30 I. CONVENE, ROOM 7000, INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING

II. SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS-INTERVIEWS

9:35 1. Department of the Army, Corps of Engineers

- a. NCO Open Mess, Fort Myer
 - b. Enlisted Mens' Service Club, Fort Myer
 - c. NCO Family Housing, Fort Myer
- (representatives of Corps of Engineers)

10:30 2. District of Columbia Government, Department of Highways and Traffic

- a. H Street Underpass - Proposed Design
 - b. Inner Loop Freeway, Center Leg - Proposed Design
- (representatives of Department of Highways and Traffic)

11:00 3. District of Columbia Government, Department of Buildings and Grounds

a. Junior Village School - Revised Design

(Mr. Gerald Purcell, Liaison Officer, D.C. Department of Buildings and Grounds; Mr. Victor Spector, architect)

11:15 b. Elementary School, Nichols Avenue & Howard Road, S.E. - Proposed Design

(Mr. Purcell; Mr. Stanley McGaughan, architect)

~~11:30 4. D. C. Redevelopment Land Agency~~

~~Tenth Street Mall - Revised Design~~

~~(Mr. Stanley Sherman, RLA; Mr. John Wright, architect)~~

12:00

5. Department of the Navy, Area Public Works Office

- a. 1500 Man Dormitory, Bolling/Anacostia - Revised Design
- b. 300 Units of Family Housing, Bolling/Anacostia-Revised Design

(Mr. Huber, Mr. Barger, architects; Capt. Enger, Comdr. Burdick, Navy; Col Fletcher, U.S. Air Force; Mr. Barth, Office of the Secretary of Defense)

12:30

6. National Institutes of Health

Refrigeration Building - Revised Design

(Mr. Snyder, Public Buildings Service; Mr. Rocco Tricarico, architect; Mr. Howard M. Biggs, NIH)

